

Chapter Ten

Reciting Aameen silently in Salaah

The hadith I have used is by no means to go against the great Imams i.e. Imam Malik, Imam Shafi'i and Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal. Their method of Salaah is also correct as it is according to the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (may Allah bless him and grant him peace).

The hadith quoted are to show that the Fatwas of Imam Abu Hanifa are according to the Sunnah as the Ghair Muqalids object to this.

“Indeed, the only true religion in the sight of Allah is Islam; those who had received the Books differed only after the knowledge came to them, due to their hearts’ envy; and whoever disbelieves in the signs of Allah, then Allah is Swift At Taking Account.”¹

Note: The hadith numbers before the hadith indicate the different chains of narrations, hence, each chain will count as a separate hadith.

Hadith 1 - 3

Samurah ibn Jundub reported: I remembered from the Messenger of Allah two periods of silence. Saeed said: “We asked Qatadah: what are those two periods of silence? He said (one) when he began his prayer and (one) when he finished his recitation. Then he added: when he finished reciting (the closing verse of Fatiha): “*Not of those who have earned Your anger and nor of those who have gone astray.*”²

Hadith 4 - 10

Wa'il ibn Hujr (may Allah be pleased with him) narrates that he performed Salaah in the company of the Prophet, who, when reaching

1 Surah Ale Imran. Surah No:3. Verse: 19

2 Abu Dawud, book of prayer, Hadith # 779. Tirmidhi who said it is hasan, also by Ahmad.

Ghayril Magdubi ‘*Alayhim Waldolleen*, he said *Aameen* keeping his voice soft.³

Hadith 11-13

Wail Ibn Hajar (may Allah be pleased with him) narrated that I heard the Messenger of Allah (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) when he prayed ‘*Ghayril maghdhubi alayhim waladhaalleen*’, he said *Aameen* keeping his voice quiet.⁴

Hadith 14

Wa’il ibn Hujr (may Allah be pleased with him) narrates that “‘Umar and ‘Ali (may Allah be pleased with them) would not say *Bismillah* and *Aameen* aloud.”⁵

Hadith 15 - 17

Shu’bah reports from Alqamah who narrates from his father that his father performed *Salaah* with the Messenger of Allah (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) who, when reaching *Ghayril Magdubi* ‘*Alayhim Waldolleen*, said *Aameen* and kept his voice soft whilst saying it.⁶

Hadith 18 - 19

Ibn Mas’ud’s saying, “Let the Imam not pronounce four things: *tawwudh*, (‘*Audhu Billah*) *tasmiya*, (*Bismillah*) *tameen* (*Aameen*) and *tahmid* (*Rabbana Lakal Hamd*).”⁷

Hadith 20-21

Imam Abu Hanifa heard from Imam Hammad and he from Ibrahim Nakh’i reports: “There are five things the Imaam will say silently: *Thana* (*Subhanakallah Humma*), *ta-awwudh* (‘*Audhubuillah*), *tasmiya*

3 Imam Ahmad. Abu Dawud Tiyaalsi. Abu Ya’la. Tabarani. Dar al-Qutni. Nasbur Raayah, 494:1. Hakim in Mustadrak with a authentic chain of narration.

4 Abu Dawud, Tirmidhi and Ibn Abi Shaybah

5 ‘Umdatul Qari Sharah Bukhari

6 Ahmad. Dar al-Qutni. Hakim.

7 Ibn Abi Shayba narrated it in his Musannaf from Ibrahim al-Nakhi. Ibn al-Humam cited it in Fath al-Qadir, 1:204.

(*Bismillah*), tasmiya (*Bismillah*) tameen (*Aameen*) and *Allahumma Rabbana Lakal Hamd*.”⁸

Hadith 22

Narrated by Abu ‘Umar that, ‘Umar said; “*Imaam* should say four things silently, *Audhubillah, Bismillah, Aameen* and *Rabbana Lakal Hamd*.”⁹

Hadith 23

The Messenger of Allah (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) said: “Do not hasten before the *Imaam*! When he says the *takbeer*, then you should do the same. When he recites *Walad da ul leen*, then you should say *Aameen*. When he makes *ruku’* then you should make *ruku’*. And when he says *sami’-Allahu liman hamidah* then you should say *Allahumma Rabbana wa lakal hamd*.”¹⁰

With regards to the saying of *Aameen* this narration is very clear and explicit. Like in the case where the *Imaam* says *Allahu Akbar* and *Sami’-Allahu liman Hamidah* aloud, but all the followers say “*Allahu Akbar*” and “*Rabbana lakal Hamd*” softly. In the same manner when the *Imaam* recites “*Walad daul leen*” aloud, the followers should say “*Aameen*” softly.

To all of the above it is answered: All these questions pertain to matters that are open to *Ijtihad* among the scholars and are *Sunnah* and not obligatory in *Salaah*. It is impermissible for anyone to say that to do or not to do one of them is an “error that should be avoided.”

It is a wonder that anyone dare claim that ‘Ali and Ibn Mas’ud erred in their *Salaah*, since it is narrated from Abu Wa’il that they did not pronounce the *Bismillah* or the *ta-awwudh* at the beginning of *Salaah*, nor the *Aameen* at the end of the *Fatiha*.”¹¹

8 ‘Abdur Razzaq in *Al-Musannaf* and Imam Muhammad in book of *Aathar*.

9 ‘Ayni

10 Muslim

11 Tabarani narrated it in *al-Mujam al-Kabir* with a good chain as shown by Haythami in *Majma al-Zawaid*.

We find that the above was the practice of the Prophet and his companions and this is the Fatwa of Imam Abu Hanifa.

The mens' Salaah differs from the women's, the woman would raise her hands upto the shoulders due to the different physical structure of a woman and modesty etc. hence proving that the Great Imam Aazam Abu Hanifa (may Allah be pleased with him) has used the ahadith that are mentioned of the Messenger of Allah (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) as well as those ahadith where the hands are raised to the shoulder.

Imam Aazam Abu Hanifa took all ahadith into consideration and also the practises of the companions to decide that raising the hands to the ears is a Sunnah.

Common Sense

Just as Attahiyaat, Durood-e-Ibraheem, Dua-e-Maasoora are recited silently as they are not part of the Qur'an but are supplication, so is Aameen. Aameen is not part of the Qur'an and is a supplication, hence, it be prayed silently. In Bukhari it states ameen is a supplication hence it should be recited silently. Why don't you recite it then, durood, etc, loudly?

Question: Aameen is not a du'a, hence if said aloud then what is the problem?

Answer: Hafidh Ibn Kathir writes:

When someone finishes reciting surat-ul-Fatiha, it is preferable to say Aameen. Aameen means "Oh Allah, accept our du'a"

There is proof from the Qur'an that Aameen is a du'a. For example, Allah Ta'ala says in the Qur'an that Prophet Musa (upon whom be peace) prayed to Allah by saying: "*O our Lord! destroy their wealth harden their hearts...*"¹²

12 Surah Yunus. Surah No: 10. Verse 88

The Prophet Musa' brother Haroon (upon whom be peace) was standing beside him and said Aameen. Allah accepted their du'a by saying: *"The prayer of you both have been accepted..."*¹³

Prophet Musa (upon whom be peace) supplicated to Allah whereas Haroon (upon whom be peace) only said Aameen. But Allah attributed the du'a to both of them. This proves that Aameen is a du'a.¹⁴

Shawkani¹⁵ and Imam Qurtubi also write, in the interpretation of Surah Fatihah, that Aameen is a du'a.¹⁶

Now that it has been proved that Aameen is a dua, we should supplicate quietly to Allah. Proof from the Qur'an and Sunnah show that du'a should be recited quietly.

Proof from the Qur'an and Sunnah that du'a should be recited quietly

Allah says in the Qur'an:

*"Call on your Lord humbly and secretly. Undoubtedly, He likes not those who cross the limit."*¹⁷

It is proved from the above verse that all should supplicate to Allah with humility and secrecy.

It is proven from the Qur'an and Sunnah that du'a should be supplicated to Allah quietly and as Aameen is also a du'a so it should be said quietly also. That is the reason why all du'as are read silently. For example, Thanaa, Takbeer, Ta'awwudh, Tasbeeh, Tashahhud, salutation and the final sitting's du'a are all read silently, so Aameen should also be included in the above. The reason why the Imam says the Takbeer loudly is only to inform his followers that he is moving from one position to another.

13 Surah Yunus. Surah No: 10. Verse 89

14 Tafsir Ibn Kathir. Under Surah Fatihah

15 A Ghayr Muqalid.

16 Qurtabi and Fathul Qadeer under Surah Fatiha

17 Surah al-a'raf. Surah No: 7. Verse: 55

The Hadith of Aameen and Tahmeed are written under the same chapter.

Both of these Hadith mention that whosever's Aameen or Tahmeed coincides with that of the Angels' their past sins will be forgiven. It is clear now that Aameen should be said as "Rabbanaa lakal hamd" i.e. silently and individually, without rhythm.

Imam Nasaa'ee writes:

The Prophet (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) said that when the Imam says "Waladdaalleen", you should say "Aameen". This is because the angels and the Imam also say Aameen. Whosever's Aameen coincides with the Angels', his past sins would be forgiven. (Nasaa'ee, Ibn Maajah, Daarimi, chapter Tahmeed, musnad Ahmad narration of Abu Hurairah)

This Hadith proves that Aameen should be said as the Imam says his Aameen. No one hears the Imam's Aameen, so no one should hear the follower's Aameen. The Prophet (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) has also ordered us to follow the Imam, so we should say Aameen quietly.

Questions and Answers

Question: In Abu Dawood, Wa'il ibn Hajar narrates: that when the Prophet (may Allah blessings be upon him) would end sura al-Fathia with 'Waludduleen' he would also say 'Ameen' in a raised voice, does this not prove that to say Ameen loud is permissible?

Answer: There are three answers to this question firstly the Hadith in question does not mention whether this was during Salah or out of Salah, it only mentions regarding the recitation of the Messenger of Allah. (may Allah blessings be upon him) and this could mean Ameen was recited aloud out of Salah and the Hadith We quoted earlier clearly states that it was during Salah where you are not allowed to say Ameen aloud so in reality this Hadith does not contradict that Hadith

quoted earlier. Secondly if this Hadith is taken into the concept regarding saying Ameen aloud in Salah then it contradicts the Holy Quran hence it will not receive any preference, in these cases the Quran is to be followed, and it is clear from Quran & Hadeeth that Ameen must be recited silently. Finally, the Hadiths which states to say Ameen aloud are classed as 'Mansook' compared to the Holy Quran & Hadith, so We must follow the Quran & Sunnah as mentioned earlier and this is the reason why the blessed companions practised reciting Ameen quietly during Salah and would also advise others to recite Ameen silently. We must ponder over this fact because if this was not the case why else would the companions refrain from reciting Ameen aloud in there Salah.

Question: The Hadith which has been quoted by yourself earlier regarding saying Ameen quietly seems to base on weak narration's thus is classed as weak but look at Wali ibn Hajar's narration from Tirmidi which states; "Regarding Ameen, Sufyan Hadith is more authentic then Shu'ba, who has stated that the Messenger of Allah (may Allah blessings be upon him) would say Ameen in a low tone but there was a sign of Maad present meaning he would prolong the recitation while saying Ameen. Does this not prove that the correct method of saying Ameen is aloud?"

Answer: No, as the reason is that this Hadith is classed as weak because it contradicts the argument which has been used to claim the weakness of the Hadith which We have mentioned earlier regarding the saying of Ameen silently, because if wasn't for this contradiction the hadith would be accepted without any doubt. There are many answers to what I have said firstly the number of narrators to the chains of narration's to the hadith we have quoted numbers up to twenty four, surely it is not possible that all twenty four are weak this is not possible and surely you cannot doubt all of the narrators to this chain of narration to be weak and even if we were to assume all narrators to be weak then upon combining there evidence we will would be suffice to have a strong case hence the chain of narration would be also classed as strong. Secondly I would like to point out

that it is a fact that when Imam Abu Hanifa narrated this Hadith the chain of narrators to this Hadith were all strong and truth full hence it is classed as a authentic Hadith, now then if at a later stage due to passing of some time since the Imam narration the chain of narration becomes weak due to more weak narrators adding to the chain then surely this is not the fault of any of the scholars who when first received it under a sound chain of narration and even if the hadith was treated as weak before the Imam Abu Hanifa narrated it but now due to it been narrated by such a great personality it will be accepted as a sound hadith because the majority of the Ummah has accepted it and has practiced upon it. Finally, to sum up the answer it is clear from the Quran that it states that Ameen must be recited silently hence this makes the quoted hadith even stronger.

Question: It is stated In Abu Dawood that Hazrat Abu Harayrah (may Allah be pleased with him) narrates that; “when the Messenger of Allah (may Allah blessing be upon him) would complete Sua al-Fathia He would say Ameen in such loud tone that it could be heard by those standing close to him in the first row. Does this not prove that We must say Ameen in a loud tone?

Answer: In the chain of Narration of this Hadith there is a narrator called Bashar ibn Rafi whom Imam Trimidhi in the book of funeral has said as a very weak narrator also Hafiz Dhahi in Meezan as said the same. Imam Ahmad has called him Munkar al-Hadith and ibn Ma’een says his narration is Mowdu! Also, Imam Nisai does not regard this narration as a strong narration, hence this Hadith is classed as very weak so it could be followed.

Question: Imam Bukhari and Imam Muslim write: When the Prophet (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) was performing his Dhuhr and ‘Asr prayers, he recited part of the Qur’an loudly, which we could hear.

Answer: The Prophet used to carry out actions only to educate people, for example, in Salaah-ul-Dhuhr part of the Qur’an was recited loudly.

After reading this Hadith no one in the whole Ummah says that the Imam should recite any part of the Qur'an loudly in the Dhuhr and 'Asr Salaah. This is because everyone knows that the Prophet (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) only did this to educate the people. In the same way, the Hadith that mentions that the Prophet (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) said Aameen loudly does not mean that it is Sunnah to say Aameen loudly. There is also proof from the Qur'an and Sunnah that Aameen should be said quietly behind the Imam.

My question is split into two parts:

“Did the Prophet (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) say Aameen aloud all the time?”

“Did the Prophet (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) do this until he passed away?”

Hope you can prove these two questions and when doing so I do not want to hear the Prophet (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) prayed Aameen aloud etc. but I want Sahih hadith that clearly (no meanings or interpretations) states the Prophet (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) prayed Aameen aloud all the time and that he did this action until he passed away. Good luck!